

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	vii
List of abbreviations	xix

PART I: IT'S ALL IN THE FAMILY

Chapter 1.	
Introduction	3
1.1. Setting the scene	3
1.2. The three (legal) dimensions of the child's family circle	7
1.3. Research question	9
1.4. Methodology	12
1.4.1. Comparative method	12
1.4.2. Structure of the book	13
1.4.3. Terminology	16
1.5. Choice of jurisdictions	17
1.6. Recent developments	19
Chapter 2.	
The family tree	21
2.1 Introduction	21
2.2. The family tree	23
2.2.1. The branches of the tree	23
2.2.2. Family pictures	26
2.3. Genetic families	27
2.4. Partially genetic primary families	28
2.5. Partially genetic secondary families	32
2.6. Non-genetic families	34
2.7. Working with the family tree	35

PART II: TYPICAL FAMILIES

Chapter 3.

Traditional genetic families	39
3.1. Introduction	39
3.2. England: Legal parenthood	41
3.2.1. Marriage	44
Maternity	44
Establishment of paternity	44
Rebuttal of paternity	44
Post-mortal procreation	45
3.2.2. Non-formalised relationship	46
Maternity	46
Voluntary establishment of paternity with(out) maternal cooperation	46
Involuntary establishment of paternity	48
Paternity and assisted conception	49
Rebuttal of paternity	51
Post-mortal procreation	51
3.2.3. Internal comparison	52
Maternity	52
Establishment of paternity	52
Denial/rebuttal of paternity	52
Paternity and assisted conception	52
Post-mortal procreation	53
3.3. The Netherlands: Legal parenthood	53
3.3.1. Marriage	54
Maternity	54
Establishment of paternity	55
Denial of paternity	55
Post-mortal procreation	55
3.3.2. Non-marital registered relationship	56
Maternity	56
Voluntary establishment of paternity with(out) maternal cooperation	56
Involuntary establishment of paternity	57
Paternity and assisted conception	58
Denial of paternity	58
Post-mortal procreation	58

3.3.3. Non-formalised relationship	58
Maternity	58
Voluntary establishment of paternity with(out) maternal cooperation	59
Involuntary establishment of paternity	60
Paternity and assisted conception	61
Denial of paternity	61
Post-mortal procreation	61
3.3.4. Internal comparison	62
Maternity	62
Establishment of paternity	62
Denial of paternity	62
Paternity and assisted conception	63
Post-mortal procreation	63
3.4. External Comparison: Legal parenthood	64
Maternity	64
Establishment of paternity	64
Denial/rebuttal of paternity	65
Paternity and assisted conception	65
Post-mortal procreation	66
An English case under Dutch law and vice versa	66
Some concluding remarks	68
3.5. England: Parental responsibility	70
3.5.1. Marriage	72
Attribution	72
Termination and relationship breakdown	72
3.5.2. Non-formalised relationship	73
Attribution to mother	73
Attribution to father with maternal cooperation	73
Attribution to father without maternal cooperation	74
Attribution to father who is not a legal parent	75
Termination and relationship breakdown	75
3.5.3. Internal comparison	76
Attribution to mother	76
Attribution to father	76
Termination and relationship breakdown	76
Concluding remarks	76

3.6.	The Netherlands: Parental responsibility	77
3.6.1.	Marriage	77
	Attribution	77
	Termination and relationship breakdown	78
3.6.2.	Non-marital registered relationship	78
	Attribution	78
	Termination and relationship breakdown	78
3.6.3.	Non-formalised relationship	80
	Attribution to mother	80
	Attribution to father with maternal cooperation	80
	Attribution to father without maternal cooperation	81
	Attribution to father who is not a legal parent	82
	Termination and relationship breakdown	82
3.6.4.	Internal comparison	83
	Attribution to mother	83
	Attribution to father	83
	Termination	83
	Some concluding remarks	84
3.7.	External Comparison: Parental responsibility	84
	Attribution to mother	84
	Attribution to father with maternal cooperation	85
	Attribution to father without maternal cooperation	86
	Attribution to father who is not a legal parent	86
	Termination and relationship breakdown	86
	Some concluding remarks	88
3.8.	Children and their legal position vis-à-vis their parents	89
3.8.1.	Legal parenthood	89
3.8.2.	Parental responsibility	89

PART III: ATYPICAL FAMILIES

Chapter 4.

Partially genetic secondary families 93

4.1.	Introduction	93
4.2.	Tendencies	96
4.3.	Legal parenthood	99
4.3.1.	Re-registration or recognition by the new parent	99

4.3.2. Adoption by the new parent	102
4.3.2.1. Adoption: consent of the parent outside the secondary family	103
A. The other parent has parental responsibility	104
B. The other parent is a biological and/or legal parent but has no parental responsibility	105
C. The child has a biological parent who is not a legal parent	107
D. The child has a social parent with parental responsibility	109
4.3.2.2. Adoption: other requirements	111
Stability in the relationship	112
Living with the child	112
Consent of the child to the adoption	112
Age of the adopter and the adoptee	113
4.3.3. Overall view on the new parent and legal parenthood	113
4.4. Parental responsibility	115
4.4.1. The new parent has become a legal parent	115
4.4.1.1. Through recognition of re-registration	115
4.4.1.2. Through adoption	117
4.4.2. The new parent has not become a legal parent	118
4.4.3. Some problems highlighted	124
4.4.4. Overall view on parental responsibility	127
Chapter 5.	
Surrogate genetic families	131
5.1. Introduction	131
5.2. England	132
5.2.1. Commissioning parents are married: the parental order	134
5.2.2. Commissioning parents <i>not</i> eligible for a parental order: adoption	135
5.2.3. Internal comparison	137
5.3. The Netherlands	137
5.3.1. Divestment of parental responsibility followed by joint adoption	141
5.3.2. Recognition followed by divestment of parental responsibility and partner adoption	142
5.3.3. Recognition followed by the transfer of parental responsibility and partner adoption	143

5.3.4. Internal comparison	144
5.4. External comparison	145
Chapter 6.	
Partially genetic primary families	147
6.1. Introduction	147
6.2. Gamete donation and legal parenthood	150
6.2.1. Birth mother	152
6.2.2. The father is married to the birth mother	152
6.2.2.1. Establishment of paternity	152
Sperm donation	152
Egg donation	157
6.2.2.2. Post-mortal procreation	157
6.2.3. The father is in a registered partnership with the birth mother	158
6.2.3.1. Voluntary establishment of paternity with(out) maternal consent	158
6.2.3.2. Involuntary establishment of paternity	158
6.2.3.3. Paternity and post-mortal procreation	159
6.2.4. The father is not in a formalised relationship with the birth mother	159
6.2.4.1. Establishment of paternity	159
Sperm donation	159
Egg donation	162
6.2.4.2. Post-mortal procreation	163
6.2.5. Co-mother in a female same-sex relationship	163
6.2.5.1. Adoption by the co-mother	167
Stability in the relationship	167
Living with the child	168
Parental consent and the position of the biological father	169
6.2.5.2. Establishing a co-mothers legal parenthood without her cooperation	174
6.2.5.3. Post-mortal procreation	174
6.2.6. Comparison legal parenthood	174
6.2.6.1. Legal parenthood of the birth mother's partner	174
By operation of law	174
Voluntary establishment (with maternal consent)	175
Establishment without maternal consent	176
Involuntary establishment	176

Post-mortal procreation	177
Denial by the child of the legal parenthood of the co-mother or non-biological father	177
6.2.6.2. Status of the sperm donor	178
6.2.6.3. Concluding remarks	180
6.3. Gamete donation and parental responsibility	182
6.3.1. Birth mother	182
6.3.2. Father	182
6.3.2.1. Marriage	182
6.3.2.2. Non-marital registered relationship (the Netherlands only)	182
6.3.2.3. Non-formalised relationship	183
6.3.2.4. Termination of parental responsibility	184
6.3.3. Co-mother	185
6.3.3.1. Marriage	185
6.3.3.2. Non-martial registered relationship	185
6.3.3.3. Non-formalised relationship	187
6.3.3.4. Termination of parental responsibility	190
6.3.4. Parental responsibility and the biological father/donor	191
6.3.5. Comparison: Parental responsibility	191
6.3.5.1. Unmarried fathers and co-mothers	191
6.3.5.2. Without maternal cooperation	192
6.3.5.3. The biological father	192
6.3.5.4. Termination of parental responsibility	192
6.3.5.5. Some concluding remarks	193
6.4. Gamete donation: English and Dutch cases compared	194
6.4.1. Parenthood in lesbian families	195
6.4.2. Extramarital sex and the rights of the biological father	197
6.4.3. Some concluding remarks	198
6.5. Surrogacy in combination with egg or sperm donation	199
6.5.1. Scenarios 1 and 2: Partially genetic commissioning different-sex couples	200
6.5.2. Scenario 3: Partially genetic commissioning female same-sex couples	202
6.5.3. Scenario 4: Partially genetic commissioning male same-sex couples	202
6.6. The birth mother reigns (almost) supreme	204

PART IV: ALL OTHER THINGS BEING EQUAL

Chapter 7.	
Family analysis	209
7.1. Introduction	209
7.1.1. Key concepts of the analysis	209
7.1.2. The structure of the chapter	210
7.2. Legal parenthood in traditional genetic and partially genetic primary families	211
7.2.1. The birth mother	212
7.2.2. Legal parenthood for the birth mother's partner by operation of law	213
7.2.2.1. Legal consequences of the use of third party genetic material	215
7.2.2.2. Children in Dutch different-sex registered partnerships	218
7.2.3. Voluntary establishment of the legal parenthood of the birth mother's partner with maternal cooperation	219
7.2.4. Voluntary establishment of the legal parenthood of the birth mother's partner without maternal cooperation	220
7.2.5. Involuntary establishment of the legal parenthood of the birth mother's partner	222
7.2.6. Challenging non-biological parenthood	223
7.2.7. Comparison	225
7.3. Parental responsibility	228
7.3.1. Traditional genetic and partially genetic primary families	228
7.3.1.1. Birth mother	229
7.3.1.2. Attribution to the birth mother's partner by operation of law	229
7.3.1.3. Parental responsibility for the partner with parental cooperation	231
7.3.1.4. Parental responsibility for the partner without parental cooperation	233
7.3.2. Secondary families	235
7.3.2.1. Parental responsibility for the new partner by operation of law	236
7.3.2.2. Parental responsibility for the new partner with parental cooperation	237
7.3.2.3. Parental responsibility for the new partner without the cooperation of the parent	239

7.3.3. Comparison	240
7.4. Adoption and transfer of full parental status	243
7.4.1. Adoption	243
7.4.1.1. Joint adoption	245
7.4.1.2. Partner adoption	246
7.4.2. The transfer of full parental status after a surrogacy arrangement	247
7.4.3. Concluding remarks	248
7.5. The legal position of children in male same-sex relationships under English and Dutch law	249
7.6. Family analysis visualised	251
7.6.1. On fundamentals and connecting factors	252
Biology and intention	252
Marriage	253
Non-marital registered relationships	254
Non-formalised relationships	254
7.6.2. A diagram of fundamentals and connecting factors	255
7.6.2.1. Legal parenthood	257
7.6.2.2. Parental responsibility	258
7.6.3. Towards the future	258
Chapter 8.	
Towards a new concept of parenthood: <i>Procreational responsibility</i>	259
8.1. Introduction	259
8.2. The legal position of children in a family with one biological parent and one non-biological parent	260
8.2.1. The child's options to acquire two legal parents	260
Children in different-sex and female same-sex families	260
Children in male same-sex families	262
8.2.2. Protection of the child's position in his or her family	262
Children in different-sex and female same-sex families	262
Children in male same-sex families	265
8.2.3. Possible explanation for the differences and similarities between the jurisdictions	265
8.3. <i>Procreational responsibility</i>	267
8.3.1. The legal dimensions revisited	267
8.3.2. Explanation of the new concept <i>procreational responsibility</i>	270

8.4.	Application of the concept of <i>procreational responsibility</i>	271
8.4.1.	Children born into relationships with one biological parent and one non-biological parent	271
8.4.1.1.	Legal parenthood for intentional parents without evaluating the donor's intentions	273
8.4.1.2.	Legal parenthood for the intentional parent with regard to the intentions of the donor	273
8.4.2.	Children in surrogate families	276
8.5.	How to proceed?	277
8.6.	A brief glance at the future	279

Appendices

Bibliography	285
Table of Cases	299
Curriculum Vitae	303